BDCP Steering Committee October 5, 2007	**Handout #2**

Assessment of "Close Calls" in Ranking the Options for Covered Fish Species

This handout provides a summary of the "close calls" made in the Options Evaluation in comparing the relative performance of the Options in addressing covered fish species. Table 7-1 from the Options Evaluations is provided below with explanatory text following.

Table 7-1. Comparison of Options by Covered Fish Species

Species	Performance Rank[1]			
	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4
Delta smelt	●	●●	●●●	●●●●
Longfin smelt	●	●●	●●●	●●●●
Sacramento River Salmonids	●●●	●●●	●●●	●●●●
San Joaquin River Salmonids	●	●●	●●●	●●●●
White Sturgeon	●	●●●	●●●	●●●●
Green Sturgeon	●●●	●●●	●●●	●●●●
Sacramento splittail	●●	●●	●●●	●●●●

Notes:

1. Based on information presented in Tables H-1 to H-9 addressing Biological Criteria #1-7.

Species performance ranks are:

●●●● = Best performing,
●●● = Second best performing,
●● = Third best performing,
● = Lowest performing

Where ranks are equal the two Options receive same rank

Delta smelt – Options ranked out clearly.

Longfin smelt – Options ranked out clearly.

Sacramento River salmonids – Option 4 clearly ranked the best among the Options. Based on uncertainties, Options 1, 2, and 3 were too close to clearly distinguish any differences in performance among them. As a result, these Options were ranked equally. If a decision had to be made regarding the relative ranking of Options 1, 2, and 3, Options 1 and 2 would likely perform identically and both would likely perform marginally better than Option 3.

San Joaquin River salmonids – Options ranked out clearly.

Green and white sturgeon – Options ranked out clearly. Benefits to sturgeon, however, hinge on the ability of each Option to address a single moderately important stressor—reduced rearing habitat. Consequently, the potential differences in the magnitude of benefits at a population level that would be associated with restoring habitats under each Option could be small enough to possibly warrant ranking all the Options the same.

Sacramento splittail – Option 4 clearly ranked the best, Option 3 clearly ranked second best, but Options 1 and 2 were too close to distinguish among each other given the levels of certainty. As a result, they were given equal ranks. If a decision had to be made regarding the relative ranking of Options 1 and 2, Option 2 could potentially perform marginally better than Option 1.